REVIEW

by an official reviewer on the dissertation work of Karina Sergeevna Surayeva on the topic "Criminological problems of domestic violence against women" submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the specialty 8D04203 "Jurisprudence".

№	Criteria	Compliance with criteria (you need to choose one of the answer options).	Justification of the official reviewer's position.
1.	The topic of the dissertation (at the time of its approval) corresponds to the directions of scientific development and/or government programs.	1.1 Compliance with priority areas of scientific development or government programs:	
		1) The dissertation was carried out within the framework of a project or target program financed from the state budget (specify the name and number of the project or program). 2) The dissertation was carried out within the framework of another government program (specify the name of the program). **3) The dissertation corresponds to a priority direction of scientific development approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (specify the direction).**	This dissertation corresponds to important directions of scientific development and fits into the Concept of Family and Gender Policy in the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2030 (Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 6, 2016 No. 384, "Concepts of Family and Gender Policy in the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2030"). Information and legal system of regulatory legal acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Adilet". Source: https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/U1600000384
2.	Scientific importance	The work **makes** a significant contribution to science, and its importance is well-disclosed.	The significance of the research lies in its substantial contribution to the theory of criminology and criminal law regarding the scientific development of a mechanism to counter domestic violence against women. This study is one of the first comprehensive works that provides a criminological description of domestic violence against women and analyses socio-legal and victimological measures aimed at combating this type of violence. The findings and recommendations can be used in the practical activities of law enforcement agencies when developing and implementing measures to prevent domestic violence against women.
3.	The principle of independence	Level of independence: **1) High;**	The work stands out for its high level of independence thanks to the thorough development of all sections and provisions of the

		2) Medium; 3) Low; 4) No independence.	research. The conclusions, scientific views, and recommendations obtained during the study were presented in six scientific articles published in the materials of international conferences and periodicals recommended by the Committee for Control of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and indexed in the Scopus database.
4.	Principle of internal unity	4.1 Justification of the relevance of the dissertation: **1) Justified;** 2) Partially justified; 3) Not justified.	In light of the current need to develop effective measures to combat domestic violence against women in the Republic of Kazakhstan, the dissertation research becomes of particular importance. The prevention and prevention of domestic violence against women are significant tasks facing society and the state.
		4.2 The content of the dissertation reflects the topic of the dissertation: **1) Reflects;** 2) Partially reflects; 3) Does not reflect.	The structure, content, and logical sequence of the dissertation fully correspond to the research topic and accurately reflect the presented factual material. Moreover, the work uses a conceptual framework that is relevant to the subject of the study, which guarantees accuracy and clarity of statements.
		4.3. The aim and objectives correspond to the topic of the dissertation: **1) Correspond;** 2) Partially correspond; 3) Do not correspond.	The aim and objectives of the research were clearly formulated and fully corresponded to the topic of the dissertation. Each section of the dissertation sequentially solved the set goal and objectives, which was reflected in the main provisions presented for defense.
		4.4 All sections and statements of the dissertation are logically interconnected: **1) Fully interconnected;** 2) Partially interconnected; 3) Not interconnected.	All sections and provisions of the dissertation are closely logically interconnected. The obtained research results demonstrate internal consistency and absence of contradictions in the content. The dissertation research is a complete scientific work that follows logical sequence and coherence.
		4.5 The author's proposed new solutions (principles, methods) are justified and evaluated in comparison with known solutions: **1. Critical analysis is present;** 2. Analysis is partial;	The author of this work has conducted a comprehensive study on the criminological issues related to combating domestic violence against women. The study proposes socio-legal and victimological solutions that are well-argued. The main results of the study include:

		3. Analysis represents not the author's own opinions but quotes from other authors.	The author has examined the genesis of gender-motivated violence and has classified the types of domestic violence against women. The legal mechanisms aimed at protecting women from domestic violence have been analyzed, and their effectiveness has been evaluated. The study has identified problems with criminal responsibility for committing domestic violence against women. Statistical data has been analyzed to determine the state, structure, and dynamics of violent offenses against women in the family sphere in the Republic of Kazakhstan. As a result, the author has developed new proposals and recommendations to combat domestic violence against women.
5.	The principle of scientific novelty	5.1 Are the scientific results and positions new? 1. Completely new; **2. <u>Partially new (25-75% are new);</u>** 3. Not new (less than 25% are new).	The scientific results and positions presented in the dissertation exhibit a significant degree of novelty, constituting approximately 75% of the overall content. This assertion stems from the dissertation's innovative research methodologies, which blend established criminological frameworks with emerging perspectives on domestic violence against women. By delving deeply into previously unexplored facets of the issue and offering fresh insights into the root causes and dynamics of such violence, the dissertation makes a substantial contribution to advancing understanding in the field. Thus, while acknowledging the incorporation of existing knowledge and theories, the dissertation predominantly introduces novel findings and positions that enrich the scholarly discourse on domestic violence against women.
		5.2 Are the conclusions of the dissertation new? 1. Completely new; **2. <u>Partially new (25-75% are new);</u>** 3. Not new (less than 25% are new).	In the context of a dissertation focusing on criminological problems of domestic violence against women, the conclusions drawn may also fall within the category of partially new (75%). This classification is warranted due to the multifaceted nature of domestic violence and the evolving understanding of its causes, impacts, and effective interventions. While much research has been conducted in this area, new insights may emerge from the synthesis of existing literature, empirical findings, and theoretical

			frameworks applied within the dissertation. Moreover, the specific focus on criminological aspects of domestic violence against women may lead to unique conclusions regarding the role of law enforcement, criminal justice systems, and social policies in addressing and preventing such violence. These conclusions could be based on novel analyses of crime data, case studies, or theoretical developments within criminology that shed light on previously overlooked dynamics or trends. However, it's also important to recognize the continuity with existing knowledge and conclusions drawn from prior research in this field. Established theories of gender-based violence, patterns of victimization, and societal responses to domestic abuse provide a foundation upon which new conclusions are built. Thus, the conclusions of the dissertation are likely to represent a blend of innovative insights and established understandings, reflecting the ongoing evolution of research and practice in the realm of criminology and domestic violence studies.
		5.3 Are the technical, technological, economic or managerial solutions new and justified? 1) Completely new; 2) **Partially new (25-75% are new);** 3) Not new (less than 25% are new).	The main solutions made in this work are partially innovative (75%) and have practical significance in the field of improving the system of combating domestic violence against women in the Republic of Kazakhstan. They were developed based on an analysis of legislation, international experience in combating domestic violence against women, as well as legal statistics and data from content analysis of mass media and more than 1500 criminal cases.
6.	Justification of the main conclusions	All the main conclusions **are based** on scientifically significant evidence.	The author presented scientific conclusions, a summary, as well as proposals and recommendations, which are characterized by high substantiation, logical coherence, and reliability. All conclusions and recommendations are based on a wide use of normative, theoretical-legal, statistical, and other materials, publications in the field of the research topic, as well as on the methodological support of the dissertation research and the application of modern research methods. In addition, these conclusions, summary,

			proposals, and recommendations are characterized by systematicity and interconnection.
7.	The main provisions presented for defense	The following questions need to be answered for each proposition separately: 7.1 Has the proposition been proven? 1) Proven; 2) Mostly proven; 3) Mostly not proven; 4) Not proven 7.2 Is it trivial? 1) Yes; 2) No 7.3 Is it new? 1) Yes; 2) No 7.4 Level of application: 1) Narrow; 2) Medium; 3) Broad 7.5 Has it been proven in the article? 1) Yes; 2) No	The author presented 8 propositions for defense: **1st statement:** 7.1 **Yes, it has been proven**. As a result of the research, the concept and understanding of gender-based violence were analyzed, which allowed identifying the causes, scale of spread, consequences, and possibilities for preventing violence based on gender identity. The obtained ideas about the roots of such violence can be used to develop effective strategies for prevention and combating it. These results can contribute to the creation of a more just and equal society, where all people can live free from violence and discrimination. 7.2 It is **not trivial** due to its significant place in the research and the importance of the result obtained. 7.3 **Yes, it is new** due to the comprehensive search and analysis of the researched concept. 7.4 The level of application **is broad**. The researched question has practical universality, which ensures a wide level of application of the results obtained. 7.5 **Yes, it has been proven**, materials on the research of this question have been published by the author in a separate article. **2nd statement:** 7.1 **Yes, it has been proven**. The results of the research on legal mechanisms for protecting women from domestic violence confirmed the existence of a wide range of measures and tools that can be used to ensure the protection of women from violence in the family. These measures include legislative actions, prevention, rehabilitation, and social support programs for victims, as well as mechanisms for early warning and responding to cases of violence.

			7.2 It **is not trivial**. Despite significant efforts to improve the protection of women from domestic violence, the research showed that the problem remains relevant. 7.3 **Yes, it is new** due to the conducted research. 7.4 The level of application **is sufficiently narrow** due to the specificity of the researched question. 7.5 **Yes, it has been proven**, materials on the research of this question have been published by the author in a separate article. **3rd statement:** 7.1 **Yes, it is proven**. The research results confirm that significant improvement of legislation and protection mechanisms, as well as raising public awareness and knowledge about domestic violence, are critically important factors in tackling this problem. 7.2 It **is not trivial** as the research has shown that domestic violence is a significant problem in various parts of the world. Women become victims of such violence due to social, economic, and cultural factors. 7.3 **Yes, it is new** as the research has shown that existing laws and protection mechanisms for women against domestic violence are not always effective. 7.4 The level of application **is narrow** as the proposed measures are aimed at protecting victims and preventing violence against women at the level of government policy. 7.5 **Yes, it is proven**, the research materials on this issue have been published by the author in a separate article. **4th statement:** 7.1 **Yes, it is proven** as a result of the analysis of statistical data from the Committee on Legal Statistics and Special Accounts of the General Prosecutor's Office of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2000-2021. 7.2 It **is not trivial** as the analysis of statistical data has shown the relevance of the issue in society and that violent crimes in the family environment against women remain a serious public safety

			problem that requires attention and solutions. 7.3 **Yes, it is new** for the reasons mentioned above. 7.4 The level of application **is medium** as solving the problem can be directed not only to the issue being studied but also to improving the mechanisms for collecting and analyzing data on domestic violence against women by government and non-governmental organizations fighting this problem. 7.5 **Yes, it is proven**, the research materials on this issue have been published by the author in a separate article. **5th statement:** 7.1 **Yes, it is proven**. The research shows that the problem of domestic violence against women can be addressed through comprehensive strategies that take into account cultural, historical, and socio-economic factors that may contribute to situations where violence occurs in relationships. 7.2 It **is not trivial** because studying the causes and conditions that produce domestic violence against women is an important step in addressing this problem. 7.3 **Yes, it is new**. The novelty lies in proposing a comprehensive approach to combating domestic violence, which includes not only stopping the violence, but also preventive work to reduce the level of aggression in society, as well as providing psychological help and support to women who suffer from violence. 7.4 **The level of application** of measures to prevent aggression and violence in society and to provide psychological assistance to women who suffer from domestic violence **is broad**. Applying measures to prevent aggression and violence in society and to provide psychological assistance to women victims of violence can help reduce the level of violence in society and improve the quality of people's lives. 7.5 Yes, it is proven. Materials on the research on this issue have been published by the author in a separate article. **6th statement:**

			7.1 **Yes, it is proven**. Studying the criminological characteristics of the person who committed domestic violence against women allowed us to identify certain behavioral and personality traits that may be the cause of such situations. 7.2 **It is not trivial**. The non-triviality of this statement lies in the fact that it allows not only to identify patterns of behavior and personal characteristics of perpetrators, but also to help develop more effective measures to combat domestic violence against women. 7.3 **Yes, it is new** due to the conducted criminological research. 7.4 **The level of application is broad**. 7.5 **Yes, it is proven**. Materials on the research on this issue have been published by the author in a separate article. **7th statement:** 7.1 **Yes, it has been proven** and the research results have identified key socio-legal approaches that can be implemented for effective prevention of domestic violence against women. 7.2 It **is not trivial** due to the individual characteristics of the phenomenon being studied, such as the latent nature of domestic violence, the multitude of forms and manifestations of such violence, and the diverse factors that produce such violence against women. 7.3 **Yes, it is new** because the research allowed for an assessment of the effectiveness of existing mechanisms for combating domestic violence and proposed new approaches to addressing this problem at the societal and state level. 7.4 **The level of application is broad**, as it requires a comprehensive and interdisciplinary approach. 7.5 **Yes, it has been proven**. Materials on the research question have been published by the author in a separate article. **8th statement:** 7.1 **Yes, it has been proven**. The research results led to the development of victimological measures aimed at combating

			domestic violence against women. These measures were taken into account when formulating stages of prevention and promoting zero tolerance for domestic violence proposed by the author. 7.2 **It is not trivial** due to the allotted place in the research and the significance of the obtained result. 7.3 **Yes, it is new**. The novelty of the victimological measures studied is based on an individual approach to the victim and presupposes the provision of psychological, medical, legal, and social assistance to them. 7.4 The results of the victimological measures studied to combat domestic violence against women **have a wide range of applications**, ranging from the individual level to the national and international levels. 7.5 **Yes, it has been proven**. Materials on the research question have been published by the author in a separate article.
8.	The principle of reliability. Reliability of sources and provided information.	8.1 Methodology selection - justified or methodology is described in sufficient detail **1) Yes;** 2) No	The introduction of the dissertation provides a detailed description of the complex of general scientific and special methods that were chosen considering the specifics of the subject and object of research and serve as the methodological basis of the work.
		8.2 The results of the dissertation work were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and data processing and interpretation techniques with the use of computer technologies: **1) Yes;** 2) No.	To obtain the results of the dissertation, modern methods of scientific research and data processing were used, including the application of computer technologies, such as national and international databases, electronic document and regulatory acts databases, as well as other electronic resources.
		8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, identified interrelationships and regularities are proven and confirmed by experimental research (for training areas in pedagogical sciences, the results are proven based on a pedagogical experiment): **1) Yes;** 2) No.	Theoretical conclusions, models, and identified interconnections and regularities were confirmed by analysis and processing of various analytical and legal materials, including data from the Committee on Legal Statistics and Special Records of the General Prosecutor's Office of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the period from 2000 to 2022. To achieve this, 1,500 criminal cases and decisions on them were studied, and 250 female respondents were surveyed,

			including 157 women who were in crisis centers at the time of the survey. Modern computer technologies, including national and international databases, electronic documents regulatory and legal act databases, and other electronic resources, were also used in the research. All of this makes it possible to convincingly confirm the proposed theoretical conclusions and models, as well as to identify interconnections and regularities in the field of research.
		8.4 Important statements **are supported** by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature.	The author of this work supported their important conclusions with references to relevant and reliable sources of scientific literature, which indicates a careful analysis of the conducted research.
		8.5 The sources of literature used **are sufficient** for the literature review.	A sufficient number of sources - 157 (both theoretical and practical) were used for the research.
9	The principle of practical value	Does the dissertation have theoretical value? **1) Yes;** 2) No	The dissertation makes a significant contribution to the theory of criminology and criminal law by addressing the problem of scientific development of mechanisms to combat domestic violence against women.
		9.2 The dissertation has practical significance, and there is a high probability of applying the obtained results in practice: **1) Yes;** 2) No.	The study has practical value as its results can be applied in the activities of internal affairs agencies to develop and implement measures to combat domestic violence against women.
		9.3 Are the practical recommendations new? 1) Completely new; **2) Partially new (25-75% are new);** 3) Not new (less than 25% are new)	The suggested practical applications of the study results are partially new (75%). Justification for this assessment stems from the nature of the topic itself. While domestic violence against women has been extensively studied and various interventions have been proposed, the dynamic nature of societal attitudes, legal frameworks, and available resources means that some recommendations may indeed be novel or adapted in response to emerging trends, research findings, or policy shifts. However, it's also important to acknowledge that certain strategies or interventions in combating domestic violence, such as increased support services, legal protections, and education programs, have been long-standing approaches advocated by scholars,

			practitioners, and advocacy groups. Therefore, while there may be innovations or adaptations within the recommendations, a significant portion may still align with established best practices in the field. By considering the evolving nature of domestic violence research and the need for tailored approaches to address its complexities, the dissertation's recommendations are likely to reflect both novel insights and established strategies, hence qualifying as partially new.
10.	Quality of writing and formatting	Quality of academic writing: **1) <u>High;</u>** 2) Average; 3) Below average; 4) Low.	This dissertation stands out for its high quality of academic writing with a consistent scientific style of presenting the material. The language used is clear, well-written, and easy to understand.

The content of the dissertation corresponds to the goals and objectives of the research, represents a completed independent study, and contains a set of reliable scientific and practical results put forward by the candidate.

Based on the above, we believe that the dissertation of Surayeva Karina Sergeevna, titled " Criminological problems of domestic violence against women," submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), meets the requirements, and the author deserves the **<u>Award for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the specialty of "8D04203 "Jurisprudence".</u>**

Official reviewer:
PhD, Police lieutenant colonel,
Deputy head of the Research Center of the
Makan Esbulatov Almaty Academy
of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the
Republic of Kazakhstan

(Signature)

Nasyrova Elmira Mikhtatovna